

Residential Fire Sprinklers Problems with NFPA 13D

Prepared For: NAHB, February 8th, 2008

Prepared By: Richard Schunk, CEO Wyndham Homes, Inc.

Executive Summary: The subject of residential fire sprinkler systems for one and two family dwellings is complex and dynamic. There are many problems and issues in addition to those presented below and very few clear solutions. One of the underlying problems is that there are many types of residential sprinklers systems, each with its unique set of problems and solutions. The fire sprinkler manufacturers have done a good job of creating alternative systems for different applications, but have done a poor job of integrating these systems into one and two family dwellings. Until solutions for these problems are clearly identified and guidelines are available as to which systems integrate best under different circumstances, mass adoptions of mandates to install fire sprinklers in one and two family dwellings would only lead to mass confusion and increased costs of construction.

Fire sprinklers are not typically installed in one and two family dwellings throughout the United States. However, in recent years their use has grown as they have become mandated in some municipalities. The most obvious objection to sprinkler systems is their cost, but cost is not the only issue. There are many technical issues that must be resolved before considering installing sprinklers. The problems vary based on the type of water supply system (public vs. well) and with geographic location, primarily due to outdoor temperatures.

1. **Public Water Supply:** A typical domestic water supply for one and two family dwellings includes a 5/8" water service and meter and may include a water pressure regulator and/or a backflow preventer. All of these devices are designed for a typical residential water flow rate of 5 to 7 gallons per minute (gpm). They cannot deliver the 26 gpm required by a residential fire sprinkler system. At a minimum, all of these devices need to be increased in size, typically to 1 1/4". Increasing the size of these devices is a hidden cost that is often overlooked because it is part of the plumber's job, and is therefore not included in the fire sprinkler contractor's bid. In addition there are technical problems that must be addressed as follows:
 - A. A residential water pressure regulator (pressure reducer) that is increased in size to handle the higher fire flows will not properly reduce the water pressure when operating at the low flow rates that are typical in one and two family dwellings.
 - B. A water meter that is increased in size to handle the higher fire flows will not accurately register the low flows that are typical in one and two family dwellings. Additionally, many water purveyors' rates increase with the size of the water meter.

A simple solution to both of these problems is to connect the fire sprinkler system to the water service before both the pressure regulator and the water meter and to install a typical size residential pressure regulator and water meter to supply the home. However, most water purveyors' require that the pressure regulator be installed before the water meter, and because they also require that all water be metered, the fire sprinkler connection cannot be before the pressure regulator. Unfortunately, water purveyors' are not regulated by building codes and short of an act of Congress this is not a viable solution.

Another solution to these problems is to install a seconded larger water service dedicated to the fire sprinkler system. This solution is not only expensive initially, but will have ongoing cost because many water purveyors' have a minimum monthly rate per meter (even when there is no consumption). Also rates typically increase with the size of the water meter, so the fire sprinkler meter rates will be more then the rates for the domestic water meter. Again, adding a seconded larger water service and meter is a hidden cost that is often overlooked because it is part of the plumber's job, and is therefore not included in the fire sprinkler contractor's bid.

2. **Private Water Supply (Wells):** Water supplied from a private well is similar to that of a public water system in that the required flow rate is the same 5-7 gpm, however the source of the water is from a well that is typically 100 – 600 ft deep. A pump near the bottom of the well pumps the water into a small pressurized water storage tank (typically 40 gallons) located in the home. Again, increasing the size of these devices is a hidden cost that is often overlooked because it is part of the plumber's job, and is therefore not included in the fire sprinkler contractor's bid. In addition there are technical problems that must be addressed as follows:
 - A. Similar to a public water supply, the well system components are sized for residential flow rates. If these devices are increased to handle the higher flow requirements of a residential fire sprinkler system they will not function properly for the home.
 - B. It is often difficult or impossible to increase the capacity of a well to accommodate the demand of a fire sprinkler system. If the capacity of the well cannot be increased, the capacity of the storage tank will need to be increased such that it can store a minimum of 260 gallons. Because only a third of the volume of a pressurized water storage tank is

- they must meet performance requirement for wetting the opposite wall near the ceiling level. In larger rooms, this may require increased water pressure or an increase in the number of sprinkler heads to adequately protect the room. In some cases it is simply not possible to adequately cover large rooms with wall mounted sprinkler heads.
- II. Another solution is to mix antifreeze into the water. A problem with this solution is that over time the antifreeze level in the system decreases and must be maintained. Maintaining the proper level requires periodic draining of the system and refilling with the proper mixture. This is not as easy as it sounds because the piping will not drain unless all the sprinkler heads are removed and compressed air is blown into the system to force out the water. This maintenance is not only expensive but potentially very messy and difficult to perform in a finished house full of furniture. In addition, antifreeze systems that are connected to potable water supplies must be equipped with a back flow preventer. This back flow preventer is in addition to the back flow preventer that may be required by the water company and will have to be large enough to handle fire flows. It will also require regularly scheduled inspections and maintenance, all of which add to the hidden cost of residential fire sprinklers.
 - III. Another solution to prevent freezing is to install the fire sprinkler piping beneath the ceiling insulation. This requires the insulation to be installed flawlessly. Even a small uninsulated area would have catastrophic consequences. Although such a flawless job is theoretically possible it is impractical and can be easily compromised

- ii. Unless an open storage tank is used to supply the water, the system is subject to the problems related to size of water service, water meter, water pressure regulator, backflow preventer, and water softeners.
 - iii. The system is rendered inoperable with the loss of power.
- II. **Multipurpose System:** The multipurpose system utilizes the cold water piping that serves the plumbing fixtures in the home to supply the sprinkler heads. The advantage to this system is the reduced cost of installation. The disadvantage of this system are as follows:
 - a) Antifreeze cannot be used to prevent piping from freezing because the sprinkler piping and potable water piping are interconnected.
 - b) Cannot be used with well water unless large pressurized tanks are installed (see description of pressurized tanks above under Private Water Supply).
 - c) Cannot be used in conjunction with water softeners.
 - d) Sprinkler heads need to be NSF approved because most sprinkler heads contain lead which is incompatible with potable water systems.
- C. **Dry Systems:** In a dry system the sprinkler piping is filled with compressed air. If a sprinkler head is activated by a fire, the air escapes and a control panel detects the loss of air pressure and opens a valve that allows water to enter the piping. The advantage to this system is that it is not subject to freezing. The disadvantage to this system is that it takes longer to respond to a fire (the

- B. A fire sprinkler system design that shows the location of all sprinkler heads, the sizing of all piping, tanks, pumps, etc. The code is not clear as to the qualifications required to be a designer of a residential fire sprinkler system. This creates potential liability for builders as they cannot prove compliance with the requirements.
6. **Inspection:** The code is not clear on who should perform inspections and how many and at what stage of construction the inspections should take place. This creates potential liability for builders as they cannot prove compliance with the requirements.
7. **Miscellaneous Problems:** There are many problems that need to be addressed when designing a residential fire sprinkler system. Solutions for most problems are known if the designer has the appropriate experience. For example, heat from a dryer in a small laundry room has been known to falsely trigger sprinkler heads when the door to the laundry room is closed and the dryer is running; the solution is to install a sprinkler rated for a higher temperature. There are other problems that the fire sprinkler industry has yet to determine solutions for, such as a home with a two story foyer adjoining a two story family room; tests have shown that fire sp